JAMES BORINI CLIFEK

## IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF OHIO WESTERN DIVISION

:

05 MAY -6 PM 4: 29

**BRENDA K. HURSTON** 

CASE NO. C-1-01-313

Plaintiff

Judge Weber; Black M.J.

-VS-

BUTLER COUNTY DEPT. OF JOB AND FAMILY SERVICES

**NOTICE OF FILING THE** 

AFFIDAVIT OF

**BRENDA K. HURSTON** 

Hurston

COME NOW, Plaintiff, Brenda K. Hurston hereby gives notice of the filing of the affidavit of herself, which is being submitted in support of her response motion and memorandum in opposition to defendant's motion of summary judgment and motion to strike exhibits previously filed herein on April 8<sup>th</sup>, 2005.

Respectfully submitted,

Brenda K. Hurston 1812 Grand Avenue

Middletown, OH 45044

(513) 420-9692

#### **CERTIFCATE OF SERVICE**

I, Brenda K. Hurston, hereby certify that a true and correct copy of the within was sent by regular mail to Jack C. McGowan, Attorney for Defendant, Butler County Department of Job and Family Services, 246 High Street, Hamilton, Ohio 45011, this 6<sup>th</sup>, day of May 2005.

Brenda K. Hurston, Plaintiff, Pro Se

#### IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF OHIO WESTERN DIVISION

BR)	ENDA K. HURSTON	:	CASE NO. C-1-01 313
	Plaintiff	:	M.J. Judge: Timothy S. Black
-vs-		:	
	TLER COUNTY DEPT. OF B AND FAMILY SERVICES  Defendants	:	AFFIDAVIT OF Brenda K. Hurston (Plaintiff, Pro Se)
	::		<b>::::</b>
STA	ATE OF OHIO )		
СО	UNTY OF BUTLER )		
kno	OPPOSITION OF SUMMAL Brenda K. Hurston, being owledge of the exhibits and factrict Court that the following is	RY JUDGMEN EXHIBITS  g first duly s cts contained 1	WORT OF HER RESPONSE IN NT AND MOTION TO STRIKE  worn on oath and having personal herein, respectfully states to the U.S. rate to the best of her knowledge and
1.	I am over eighteen years of agoset forth.	e and am comp	etent to testify as to the matters here
2.	My gender is female and my ra	acial identity is	African American .
			(race)
3.	I reside at 1812 Grand Avenue (Number/Stree		
	City of Middletown	, County of	Butler ,
	State of Ohio	, Zip Code <u>4:</u>	5044
4.	My telephone number is (inclu	iding area code	) (513)-420-9692

- 5. I was employed at the Butler County Department of Job and Family Services, formerly Butler County Department of Human Services for approximately 13 years.
- 6. On October 13, 2004, when the defendant alleged that they turned over to me a copy of my entire personnel file and some additional documents which had been turned over to defendant's counsel by the Department of Job and Family Services as outlined in Michael E. Jacob, ESQ's letter to me, and was a attachment in his October 22, 2004 affidavit as Exhibit 1; I received Dr. Walker's letters of April 23, 1990 and May, 1990 that was stamped by personnel department and have Betty Proctor's hand writing on it. Those letters are listed as my exhibits 3-41 & 43.
- 7. On October 13, 2004, the defendant's counsel submitted to me by certified mail a copy of Dr. Randolph's May 5, 1998 report (see exhibit 746-(1-4). Dr. David C. Randolph, M.D., M.P.H. which was hired by the defendant to review my medical records in 1998 that he received from my Dr. Leonard R. Janis D.P.M.; he addressed his report to Gail Weigel, Assistant Director of Butler County Department of Human Services at that time. See Leonard R. Janis D.P.M' affidavit.
- 8. Dr. Randolph's May 5, 1998 clearly indicated the following in 1998.
  - a. Pre and post operative diagnoses and history diagnoses
  - b. I stated, "My foot is killing me", and reference is made to failure of conservative management.
  - c. X-rays shows degenerative joint disease. Therefore, the defendant already knew that I had degenerative joint disease when they made their decision not to accommodate me with a sit-down position in 1998. They also should have known that they further agitated my feet condition by, failing to accommodate my Dr.'s request again in 2000 and increasing my workload that requires me to collate, stand, walk, reach, climb up & down stairs, to lift up to 50lbs.
  - d. Dr. Randoph admits in his opinion that my job requirements permits me to sit primarily during the day and I am capable of lifting and carrying objects weighing up to at least up to 10 pounds.

With respect to Plaintiff's exhibits <u>3-(10-15)</u> which are true and correct copies of my job position description as machine Operator I (see Randy Chafin depo. Vol. II, P. 126, 1. 11 thru P.136, 1.6.

With respect to Plaintiff's exhibit 6, I verify that it is a true and correct copy of the defendant's counsel letter dated October 22, 2004, to me regarding documents in my personnel file with the EEOC.

With respect to Plaintiff's exhibits 6.6 (1-2), I verify that it is a true and correct copy of my Unfair Labor Practice Charge (Case No. 2001-ULP-03-0150) that I submitted to the State Employment Relations Board.

With respect to Plaintiff's exhibits 3-(25-34) which is a true and correct copy of Plaintiff's performance evaluation rebuttal, dated 06-11-90. I verify that I believed that I was being retaliated against as well as discrimination.

With respect to Plaintiff's exhibits 3-(37-39) which is a true and correct copy of meeting regarding falsification charges hand written by Lynn Mitchell Watkins, dated 05-07-90. I verify that I witnessed Lynn Mitchell Watkins writing those documents during the meeting on 5-7-90 and she submitted a copy of those documents to me after the meeting with me, Dianne Rice Logsdon, Betty Proctor, Lynn Mitchell and Larry Watkins-Ohio Council 8. The initials "BK" are Brenda King, "DL" is Dianne Rice Logsdon, "BP" is Betty and "LW" is Larry Watkins. I also verify that the statements of all were said at the meeting. The union knew what was going on, because their representatives (Lynn Mitchell/Union President and Larry Watkins/Staff Representative) were there at the meeting. They failed to bargain fairly in behalf of myself, although I was a dues-paying member of the union.

With respect to Plaintiff's exhibit 3-(40) is a true and correct copy of Request for Leave statement dated 4-23-90 that I submitted to the defendant on 4-24-90.

With respect to Plaintiff's exhibit 3-(41) is a true and correct copy of Dr. Walker letter dated April 23, 1990 that I submitted to the defendant on 4-24-90. Dr. Walker requested accommodation for me to wear comfortable shoe while working, dated 04-23-90. I also verify that the handwriting underneath Kenneth Walker, D.P.M. is of Betty Proctor of personnel and the letter was date-stamped by personnel 4-24-90.

With respect to Plaintiff's exhibit 3-(42) is a true and correct copy of Request for Leave statement following alleged falsification charges against the Plaintiff, dated 04-23-90; which verifies charges were pursuant.

With respect to Plaintiff's exhibit 3-(43) is a true and correct copy of letter from Dr. Walker, regarding office my office visit on 04-23-90; I verify that it was date stamped by Butler County Personnel Department on May 8, 1990.

With respect to Plaintiff's exhibits <u>3-(44-52)</u> is a true and correct copy of my Annual Evaluation, dated 06-05-90, that was submitted to me by Linda Duff.

With respect to Plaintiff's exhibits 3-(54-56) which is a true and correct copy of meeting regarding Evaluation Hearing hand written by Lynn Mitchell, dated 06-19-90. I verify that I witnessed Lynn Mitchell writing those documents during the meeting on 6-19-90 and she submitted a copy of those documents to me after the meeting with me, Dianne Logsdon, Linda Duff, Lynn Mitchell and Larry Watkins-Ohio Council 8. The initials "BK" are Brenda King, "DL" is Dianne Logsdon, "LD" is Linda Duff and "LW" is Larry Watkins. I also verify that the statements of all were said at the meeting. The union knew what was going on, because their representatives (Lynn Mitchell/Union President and Larry Watkins/Staff Representative) were there at the meeting. They failed to bargain fairly in behalf of myself, although I was a dues-paying member of the union.

With respect to Plaintiff's exhibits <u>3-(63-64)</u> is a true and correct copy of the Position Description of Purchasing Assistant 1 that I received by Charlie Treadway.

With respect to Plaintiff's exhibits 17-(10-13) is a true and correct copy regarding non discrimination, supervisory intimidation and discipline for just cause that I submitted to Heath Alpine via fax dated 03-30-00, I believe that Linda Day abuse her power by constantly trying to intimidate me, discriminate, and harass. She constantly created a hostile working environment for me and I was letting Heath MacAlpine what was going on.

With respect to Plaintiff's exhibits 100-(1-7) is a true and correct copy of Plaintiff's correspondence with EEOC that was submitted by the Plaintiff. See Sadie Williams's affidavit.

With respect to Plaintiff's exhibits <u>703-(1-2)</u> is a true and correct copy of PERS Application for Disability Benefit dated 05-31-01 that I submitted to PERS.

With respect to Plaintiff's exhibits <u>704-(1-2)</u> is a true and correct copy of Report of Attending Physician for PERS Disability dated 06-01-01, that I received from PERS.

With respect to Plaintiff's exhibits 732-(1-5) is a true and correct copy of report submitted by Dr.Richard T. Beer, to PERS, dated 08-23-01. See affidavit of Ruthie Meade.

With respect to Plaintiff's exhibits <u>732-(6-8)</u> is a true and correct copy of Application for Disability Benefit report by employer dated 06-25-01 that was submitted to me by PERS. The defendant alleges, "Employer has seen no evidence supporting a claim of permanent incapacitation to perform duties."

I declare under penalty that the foregoing is true to the best of my knowledge and belief.

Brenda K. Hurston, Plaintiff, Pro Se

SUBSCRIBED AND SWORN TO before me this \_

\_ day of <del>April</del> 2005.

**Notary Public** 

Beverly J. Renwick NOTARY PUBLIC

In and for the State of Ohio My Commission Expires November 19, 2007

Filed 05/06/2005 Page 7 of 32 5-7-90 Dianne Lie Logodon, Betty Proctor Brenda King, Lynn Mitabell. Larry Watkins - Ohis Council 8 BK Fatusification charges were going to be filed as Betty Proctor and Linds Diff couldn't confirm Brenda's appointment on 4/23/90. Brasked BK if she could contact doctor. Ruse at Dr a office specified that BK didn't have an appointment. DR advised BP to Call back because De told BK to come the same time so he siste sapp. 4-30-80 BPT LD called BK into personal office and stated that BK didn't have appl and her time off wouldn't be good. Ourstioned BK about falusifying doctor statement. 5-1-90 BK again questioned by BP+XD and stated that BK appt verified and she would be paid for time off. Lynn Mitchell gresent @ this meeting (I want an apology) & Since BK didn't have appt according to nuise at DR's office, her time sheet requesting time off was of concern regarding folsification. (Later mile nurse at DR's office confirm that GR did pantifiers BR's doctors statement was from DR's office Statement mondid. BK mill to men the trose

DS. I have apologized as the director. BP+ LD dedn't Act inapprovately so the questions which came. up. Misinformation supplied by doctors office.

Ask BP why she didn't question the nurses as to how BK received the doctors statement. All this could have been avoided if LD+ BP had apologised once the doctor confirm apple. YW.

Of Confusion began with contacting DR's office. if she wasted to speak about anything else.

BK. no I don't have any questions Why are my shoes out of dress code. Her other shoes weren't addressed until she purchased the new shoes.

De don't consider those dress shoes.

<u>and and the second of the sec</u>

PLA

Filed 05/06/2005 6Page 10 of 32 Evaluation Hearing Plain tiff's Exhibit Dianne Logodon, Linda Doff 3-54 Brende King, Lynn mitchell Larry Workins - Ohio Council 8 5 - average rating because always willing to do what is BK ask of duties to be spenformed. I'D needs to be more specific in directives of duties requested. BK approached LD in very hositle manner and gave LD LD Tro indication of misundustanding orders requested. Form requested by LD Warn't specific about how to Complete form to satisfactory 2W Willingress to accept responsibily has been shown by reorganizing mail room + forms requested throughout agency use. The comment of the contract of  $\mathcal{B}K$ Shredder - using shredder was causing white particles to be flying into mail room area. lisk I'V to do something about flying pape from shedder - obtain Caps for hair. Discussed this with Koy Kadle. It stressed Supervior has right to ask job duties but must be DL professional in attitude and manner of speich. BK Usk to do see the duty jobs." ID & other staff in oroun talking about hair senines of the Encorning weekend

Misunderstandings are taking place. BK acknowledges not working outside of job classification.
Other imployees arent requested to do jobs requested by LW. Socializing of other employees wither unit at times of groups but I am expected to work while they socializing. ID has very negative attitude toward Considerable discussion and debates by your own admission before completing tacks. LD alway makes an argument out of questions that I ask. that I ask. Do you have suggestions or remedies between you + L.O. Show more respect to me Minting - Coverages 1-90 the 4-90 944 per how after 2D factoring out coverage of orthe duties. Hypurby to print:
Pre-copy forms in place he return.
We only print orders by requisitions because forms can change and became obsilete. Copies justed out by machines. On DK machines. Come up with accurate time spent of printing. BK # 17 have been given responsibilities on my LD row in midd office and working on my own and working out quite well. IN needs to attend management

CAINTIFF'S EXHIBITS

DL Quantity Work- Willing to look at measuring or observing Printing Sime - time spent duing job duties.

tok all tratings be changed to 3 ratings

Linde prejudice against blacks. Smart remarks made to mipely. Felt pressure from LD, Rude toward me, Unforgiving & vinductive toward me.

D.L. BK's attitude toward LD must be graffesseonal and courtery. BK needs to work toward a desert working relationship.

DI to get back with an answer

3-56

MCGOWAN & JACOBS, LLC
ATTORNEYS AND COUNSELORS AT LAW
246 HIGH STREET
HAMILTON, OHIO 45011

JACK C. McGowan Michael E. Jacobs\* JCM@jcmcgowan.com MichaelJacobs@jcmcgowan.com

\*ALSO ADMITTED IN KENTUCKY AND INDIANA

TELEPHONE (513) 844-2000 FAX (513) 868-1190

October 22, 2004

#### VIA FACSIMILE

Ms. Brenda Hurston 1812 Grand Avenue Middletown, OH 45044

Re: Brenda K. Hurston vs. Butler County Job & Family Services

Dear Ms. Hurston:

I received a fax from you today and reviewed my file. I find that I forwarded documents by certified mail to you on October 13, October 19 and more documents will be going out to you no later than Monday October 25, 2004. Please be sure you have picked up your certified mail and then let me know what you believe you have not received.

I have a copy of my letter to you on October 19 by certified mail transmitting the contract effective 1987 through 1989 which was responsive to one of your requests.

I also believe that several hundred pages of your personnel file have been furnished to you. If, as you say, there are over 700 pages of your personnel file with the EEOC, those documents are public records, and you may, if you have not already, request a copy pursuant to the Freedom of Information Act.

Please give me a call to resolve this discovery dispute as soon as you have picked up your certified mail and determined what documents you feel you have not been provided.

Yours very truly,

McGOWAN & JACOBS, LLC

Jack C. McGowan

JCM/ten



Case No. 01-ULP-03-0150

STATE EMPLOYMENT RELATIONS BOARD

watt

2001 MAR 13 A 10: 04 SERB Official Time Stamp

#### UNFAIR LABOR PRACTICE CHARGE

INSTRUCTIONS: File one original and one copy of this form with the St	ate Employment Relations Board at the
above address. Serve one copy on the party against whom the charge is brou	ight. See Ohio Administrative Code Rule
4117-1-02. If more space is required for any item, attach additional sheets, i	numbering items accordingly.
1. PARTY FILING CHARGE: (check one)	
☐ Employee Organization/Union	Other
Name: Brenda Hurston	Telephone: work (513 ) 425-8696 home (513 ) 420-9692
Address: 1812 Grand Ave.	Fax: ( )
City, County, State, Zip:	
Middletown, Butler, Ohio, 45044	•
2. Name of Person Representing the Party Filing Charge: (Representative must file a Notice of Appearance form.)	Telephone:
NONE	( ) NONE
Address:	Fax:
NONE	( ) NONE
City, County, State, Zip:	
NONE	
3. Party Against Whom This Charge is Brought: (check only one)	
☐ Employee Organization/Union ☐ Employee ☐ Employer ☐ ☐	Other
Name:	Telephone:
Butler Co. Department of Job & Family Services The Government Services Center	(513) 887-4000
Address: Pruce Tewatt	Fax:
315 High St., P.O. Box 4000	(513) 887-4334
City. County, State, Zip:	
Hamilton, Butler, Chio 45012 - 40000  4. EMPLOYER: (if different from item 1 or 3)	Telephone:
Name:	( )
Address:	Fax: § PLAINTIFF'S
	Fax: ( )  See PLAINTIFF'S EXHIBIT  P 1
City, County, State, Zip:	88 6.6
	P3 /
5. Basis of Charge: The party against whom this charge is brought has engaged in o the meaning of Ohio Revised Code Section 4117.11. (Check appropriate subsection	or is engaged in unfair labor practices within ins only.)
Charges against employers: (A)(1) (A)(2) (A)(3) (A)(4) (A)(4)	(5) (A)(6) (A)(7) (A)(8) (D
Charges against unions or employees: (B)(1) (B)(2) (B)(3) (B)(4) (B)	(5) \( \begin{array}{cccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc

## POSITION PESCRIPTION

OHIO DEPARTMENT OF ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES

AGENCY <u>Butler Co. Dept. of Human Services</u> DIVISION OR INSTITUTION

PERSONNEL DIVISION

UNIT OR OFFICE Accounts Payable

	X County Agency	New Position		COUNTY OF EMPLOYMENT	
USIAL WORKING TITLE OF POSITION  Office Machine Operator 2  11400,00 Account Clock Supervisor					
FROM:	T <b>0</b> : g	hours varied			
1	08_5				
This a duplic	ang voin forms are requires operating cating machine and unting needs from	intment's print nd office memos p knowledge of d scanner. Reco n various units	ing needs, re- and reports. the Gestetner rive requests and fill these	Minimum Acceptable Characteristic  13b, 29 duplicator, scaru 30c, 30e, 32f, 32n 33a, 34B, 35c-50Lb	
Leaf n forms, needed	econd of numbered keep mastens in Leep equipment	the Department county welfare folders to be not clean and make	t, keep a Loose- 2 d <b>epartme</b> nt 1e-used as 2 minon adjust-		
ments. Orders State forms. Maintains State forms Log and Directory.					
readin	g requisitions to	caseworkers. A ascertain that	fter proof key items are	11a, 11b, 13a, 13b*, 25, 29 (Computer Terminal) 30d, 30d, 30e, 30h, 31b,	
Also a	ssists in typina.	rmation receive replacement med	d.	31c, 32f, 32g, 32h, 32i, 32j, 33a, 33b, 33d, 34b, 34d	
Mainta to acc	ins logs on purch ount lor all issue	ase orders, and	<i>]</i>		
Lorms .	to caseworkers da	returns primar ily.	y requsition	PLAINTIFF'S EXHIBITS	
tion Numbers han eight, ii	ond Class Titles of pos at totals only.	itions supervised. Si	GNATURE OF AGENCY		
	Handle produce This is duplicated in the consisting and the consisting and the consisting and consistent and co	WORKING TITLE OF POSITION  Office Machine Operato  AL WORKING HOURS (Explain unuser FROM: TO: 8  Handle most of the Department of the producing both forms and interesting machine and for printing needs from requests on a timely be different forms used by leaf record of numbered forms, keep masters in needed. Keep equipment ments. Orders State for log and Directory.  Assist in receiving and requisition forms from reading requisitions to consistent with agency in triplicate from info Also assists in typing All, 9% and medicaid remaind recount for all issue purchase orders typed. Forms to caseworkers da	WORKING TITLE OF POSITION  Office Machine Operator 2  AL WORKING HOURS (Explain unusual or rotating shift)  FROM:  TO: 3 hours varied  JOB DESCRIPTION AND W  JOB DUNES in are  Handle most of the Department's print  producing both forms and office memos  This requires operating knowledge of duplicating machine and scanner. Received for printing needs from various units  requests on a timely basis. Be familial different forms used by the Department leaf record of numbered county welfare forms, keep masters in folders to be a needed. Keep equipment clean and make ments. Orders State forms. Maintains log and Directory.  Assist in receiving and processing pure requisition forms from caseworkers. A reading requisitions to ascertain that consistant with agency policy, type pure in triplicate from information received Also assists in typing replacement medically, 9% and medical recipients.  Maintains logs on purchase orders, and to account for all issuance. Numerical purchase orders typed. Returns primary forms to caseworkers daily.	WORKING TITLE OF POSITION  Office Machine Operator 2  AL WORKING HOURS (Explain unusual of rotating shift)  FROM:  TO: 3 hours variable in order of importance  JOB Dutles in order of importances  Handle most of the Department's printing needs, reproducing both forms and office memos and reports.  This requires operating knowledge of the Gestetner, the printing needs from various units and fill these duplicating machine and scanner. Receive requests for printing needs from various units and fill these requests on a timely basis. Be familiar with the different forms used by the Department, keep a looseled record of numbered county welfare department forms, keep masters in folders to be re-used as needed. Keep equipment clean and make minor adjustments. Onders State forms. Maintains State forms log and Directory.  Assist in receiving and processing purchase order requisition forms from caseworkers. After proof reading requisitions to ascertain that key items are consistant with agency policy, type purchase orders in triplicate from information received.  Also assists in typing replacement medical cards for all, 9% and medical recipients.  Maintains logs on purchase orders, and medical cards to account for all issuance. Numerically files all surrase orders upped. Returns primary requisition forms to caseworkers daily.  This topics only.	

Filed 05/06/2005 REc'd

Page 17 of 32 /-22-89

## POSITION DESCRIPTION

OHIO DEPARTMENT OF ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES

AGENCY Butler Co. Dept. of Human Servic DIVISION OR INSTITUTION

PERSONNEL DIVISION UNIT OR OFFICE

	Stote	Agency	County A	loancy	New Positio	n Cho	inga	COUNTY OF EM	PLOYMENT utler
			TITLE OF POSI		<u></u>	POSITION N	D. AND TITE	E OF IMMEDIATE	•
			ine Operato		or ratating shift	11300	).0 O	ffice Manage	<u> </u>
		FROM:		TO:	8 hours var	ied			
	%			JOB DES	CRIPTION AND Job Dutles in o	WORKER CHA	RACTERIST		ptable Characteristics
11309.0	85%	reprod This duplie	ducing both requires op cating mach	forms a erating ine and	tment's printed office makenowledge of scanner. Revarious uni	nting need emos and m f the Gest eceive red	ds, reports. tetner quests	13b, 29 (	duplicator, 30c, 30e, 32f, , 33b, 34b,
Ŕ.		these the d a loo depar	requests c ifferent fo seleaf reco ment forms	on a time orms used ord of nu s, keep m	ely basis. I by the Depumbered countainsters in for equipment	Be familia artment, l ty welfare olders to	er with keep		
11/21/11/11/11			adjustment forms Log		ers State fo	rms. Main	ntains		
C. 11. C.	· 10%	case		sist in p	and materi ourging reco			13a, 13b	, 30c, 32e, 33
1187.10	5%	Perfo assis	m reception	onist fur is in obt	nctions dire caining requ	cting and ested ser	vices.	llb, 13h	o, 30d, 32e, 3
		<u></u>			,		***		
		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·							PLAINTIFF'S EXHIBITS
77471	·								
ji ji	ist Positi if more the	ion Number an eight,	s and Class Titi ist totals only.	les of posit	ions supervised.	SIGNATURE	OF AGENCY	REPRESENTATIV	E DATE
- 1						1		Tuce	

## POSITION DESCRIPTION

OHIO DEPARTMENT OF ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES

AGENCY Butler Co. Dept. of Human Services DIVISION OR INSTITUTION

PERSONNEL DIVISION

UNIT OR OFFICE Communications

		Do not write in shaded area		
		ate Agency X County Agency New Position X Change	COUNTY OF EMPLOYMENT Butler	
			TLE OF IMMEDIATE SUPERVISOR	
NUMBER	NORM	fice Machine Operator 2 11300:0 Of AL WORKING HOURS (Explain unusual or rotating shift.)	fice Manager 1	
13		FROM: TO: 8 hours varied		
i	04	JOB DESCRIPTION AND WORKER CHARACTERIS	TICS	
12 c	%	Job Duties in order of Importance	Minimum Acceptable Characteristics	
POSITION CONTROL	80	Handle most of the Department's printing needs, reproducing both forms and office memos and reports. This requires operating knowledge of the Roneo dupli cating machine. Receive requests for printing needs from various units and fill these requests on a time basis. Be familiar with the different forms used by	- 501b	
		county welfare department forms, keep masters in folders to be re-used as needed. Keep equipment clean and make minor adjustments. Orders State form Maintains State forms Log and Directory.		
Chor 2	5	File closed case records and materials into closed case files. Assist in purging records and preparing same for destruction.	13a,13b,30c,32e,33a	
What	5	Perform receptionist functions directing and assisting clients in obtaining requested services. Relieving on switchboard when needed.	11b,13b,30d,32e,34d	
TO II	10	Assures copy machines are properly stocked with supplies. Contacts copier repairmen when needed. Assures rotation of copiers and maintains copy count. Performs minor mechanical adjustments when		
CLASS		required. (Loading paper, removing jams, replacing toner, etc.)		
			·	
12422	·		PLAINTIEE'S EXHIBITS  3-12	
۲	ist Posit I more th	tion Numbers and Class Titles of positions supervised. SIGNATURE OF AGENCY and eight, list totals only.	REPRESENTATIVE DATE	
Quanne Opgodon 1/5/89				

10-27-89

## POSITION DESCRIPTION

OHIO DEPARTMENT OF ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES

PERSONNEL DIVISION

AGENCY Butler County Human Services DIVISION OR INSTITUTION UNIT OR OFFICE Communications

Do not write in shaded area COUNTY OF EMPLOYMENT State Agency XX County Agency New Position Y Change Butler USUAL WORKING TITLE OF POSITION POSITION NO. AND TITLE OF IMMEDIATE SUPERVISOR Office Machine Operator POSITION CONTROL NUMBER 11300.0 Office Manager 1 NORMAL WORKING HOURS (Explain unusual or rotating shift.) FROM: 8 hrs. varied JOB DESCRIPTION AND WORKER CHARACTERISTICS % Job Duties in order of Importance Minimum Acceptable Characteristics Handle most of the Department's printing needs. 13b,29 deplicator, 30c, scanne 80 reproducing both forms and office memos and reports. 11302 30e,32f,32n,33a,33b,34b,35c, This requires operating knowledge of the Roneo dupli-501b cating machine. Receive requests for printing needs from various units and fill these requests on a timely basis. Be familiar with the different forms used by the Department, keep a loose leaf record of numbered County Human Services Department forms, keep masters in folders to be re-used as needed. Keep equipment clean and make minor adjustments. Orders State forms. Maintains State forms Log and Directory. Relieving on switchboard as needed. Assist IM Aide in large conference room with screening of client forms. 10 11b,13b,30d,32e,34d Copy client verifications as needed. File closed case records and materials into closed case files. Assist in purging records and preparing 13a,13b,30c,32e,33a same for destruction. Assures copy machines are properly stocked with supplies. Contacts copier repairmen when needed. Assures 11b,13b,30d,32e,34d rotation of copiers and maintains copy count. Performs minor mechanical adjustments when required. (Loading paper, removing jams, replacing toner, etc.) CLASS PLAINTIFF'S EXHIBITS 3-13 ļŒ. List Position Numbers and Class Titles of positions supervised. SIGNATURE OF AGENCY REPRESENTATIVE DATE If more than eight, list totals only.

#### Case 1:01-cv-00313-TSB — Document 150-10-POSITION DESCRIPTION

OHIO DEPARTMENT OF ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES

Filed 05/06/2005 Page 20 of 32 Butler County Human Services

DIVISION OR INSTITUTION

PERSONNEL DIVISION

UNIT OR OFFICE Communications

Do not write in shaded area State Agency COUNTY OF EMPLOYMENT X County Agency New Position X Change Butler USUAL WORKING TITLE OF POSITION POSITION NO. AND TITLE OF IMMEDIATE SUPERVISOR 11300.0 Office Manager 1 Office Machine Operator NUMBER NORMAL WORKING HOURS (Explain unusual or rotating shift.)
FROM: TO: 8 hrs. varied CONTROL . JOB DESCRIPTION AND WORKER CHARACTERISTICS % Job Duties in order of Importance Minimum Acceptable Characteristics Handle most of the Department's printing needs, 13b,20 deplicator, reproducing both forms and office memos and reports. 30c, scanner, 30e,32f,32n, 45 POSITION This requires operating knowledge of the Roneo dupli-33a,33b,34b,35c,501b cating machine. Receive requests for printing needs from various units and fill these requests on a timely basis. Be familiar with the different forms used by the Department, keep a loose leaf record of numbered County Human Services Department forms, keep masters in folders to be re-used as needed. Keep equipment clean and make minor adjustments. Orders State forms, Ribbons & paper for CRIS-E printers. Maintains State forms Log and Directory. Distributes forms printed by vendors, maintains inventory, advises supervisor when these forms need to be replenished. Relieving on switchboard as needed. Answer all incoming 32 calls on 8 lines with 276 destinations. Transfers all incoming calls to destination. If line is busy, asks caller if they will hold or call back. Monitor rings and come back line if call is not answered promptly. Transfer calls to information center when caller wishes to know name of caseworker. Answers all calls in a professional manner, treat callers with courtesy and dispatch calls promptly. Assist IM Aide in large conference room with copying 12 client verifications as needed. Assures copy machines are properly stocked with supplies. 6 Contacts copier repairmen when needed. Assures 11b, 13b, 30d, 32e, 34d rotation of copiers and maintains copy count. Performs PLAINTIFF'S minor mechanical adjustments when required. (Loading EXHIBITS 12422 paper, removing jams, replacing toner, etc.) Loading paper and changing ribbon on CRIS-E printers. Perform other related duties as assigned by unit supervisor. œ List Position Numbers and Class Titles of positions supervised. SIGNATURE OF AGENCY REPRESENTATIVE If more than kight, list totals only. Stanny Argadon!

# POSITION DESCRIPTION

OHIO DEPARTMENT OF ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES

PERSONNEL DIVISION

	AGENCY
	Butler County Human Services
	DIVISION OR INSTITUTION
i	UNIT OR OFFICE
	Communications

Do not write in shaded area

	Siat	Agency X County Agency New Position X Change	COUNTY OF EMPLOYMENT					
Ì	1 .		! Butler - E OF IMMEDIATE SUPERVISOR					
SE3	Off:	ce Machine Operator 11100.0 Soc Pr	og Admin 1					
NUMBER	NORMAL WORKING HOURS (Explain unusual or rotating shift.) FROM: To: 8 hrs. varied							
, .	THE THE SCORE CONTROL AND MORDED COLLEGE CONTROL							
TR0	/6	Job Duties in order of Importance	Minimum Acceptable Characteristics					
POSITION CONTROL	40	Handles most of the Department's printing needs, reproducing both forms and office memos and reports. This requires operating knowledge of the Roneo duplicating machine. Receives request for printing needs from various units and fills these requests on a timely basis. Be familiar with the different forms	13b, 29 duplicator, 30 c, 32f, 32n, 33a, 33b, 34b, 35c - 501b					
4.2		used by the Department, keeping a loose-leaf record of numbered BCDHS forms, and masters. Keeps equipment clean and makes minor adjustments. Order State printed forms. Maintains State forms log and Directory.						
: 1: Walnul Ch	55	Have responsibility for the agency's supply room; maintain a perpetual inventory of all office supply items showing quantities in , quantities out, and balance on hand. Check in all orders comparing the packing slip with the invoice to verify proper order and amount received. Note any discrepancies and/or	3, 13a, 30f, 30c, 31c, 32f, 32i, 32j, 33b, 34c, 35c - 501b					
College.		back orders. Receive requests for supply items from unit supervisors and fill said requests from stockroom inventory or send requisition to the County supplies as required. If item is not included in the supplies catalog, forward request to the administrator who has procurement responsibilities.						
SLASS TITLE	5	Perform other duties as assigned by administrator.	13b, 30d, 31b, 32f, 32i, 33b					
12422	PLAINTIFF'S EXHIBITS							
	3-15							
-, j	ist Positi	on Numbers and Class Titles of positions supervised. SIGNATURE OF AGENCY in eight, list totals only.	REPRESENTATIVE DATE					
LLASS H		Nuanne 1	Logsalon 7-6-90					

Eiled 05/06/2005 OHIO DEPARTMENT OF Butler County Job & Family Services Position Division or **ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES** Administration Institution DESCRIPTION Unit or PERSONNEL DIVISION Office County of Employment □ State Agency County Agency □ New Position Change Butler Usual Working Position No. and Title Office Machine Operator 12100.0 Office Manager Title of Position of Immediate Super. Normal Working (Explain Unusual or 8 hrs. varied Hours FROM: Rotating Shift) Position Office Machine Operator Class Class Control Number 12422 Title 12106.0 Office Machine Operator 2 Number JOB DESCRIPTION AND WORKER CHARACTERISTICS % Job Duties in Order of Importance Minimum Acceptable Characteristics 70% Handles most of the Department's printing needs, reproducing both Knowledge of (13b) Agency Policies & Procedures, (29) forms and office memos and reports. This requires operating duplicator; Ability to (30c) carry out detailed but basic knowledge of the Roneo duplicating machine. Receives request written or oral instructions, (32f) comprehend short for printing needs from various units and fills these requests on a sentences with basic, concrete vocabulary, (32n) screen timely basis. Be familiar with the different forms used by the mail, (33a) arrange items in numerical or alphabetical Department, keeping a loose-leaf record of numbered BCDJFS order, (33b) sort items into categories according to forms, and masters. Keeps equipment clean and makes minor established methods, (34b) work alone on most tasks, adjustments. Order State printed forms. Maintains State forms log (35c) strength to lift up to 50 lbs. and Directory. 20% Knowledge of (3) Inventory Control, (13a) Office Prac-Have responsibility for Middletown supply room; maintain a perpetual inventory of all office supply items showing quantities tices & Procedures; Ability to (30c), (30f) deal with probin, quantities out, and balance on hand. Check in all orders lems involving several variables in familiar context, (31c) comparing the packing slip with the invoice to verify proper order comprehend & record figures accurately, (32f), (32i) and amount received. Note any discrepancies and/or back orders. comprehend simple sentences with common vocabulary, Receive requests for supply items from unit supervisors and fill (32i) copy material accurately & recognize grammatical & said requests from stockroom inventory or send requisition to the spelling errors, (33b), (34c) cooperate with co-workers on County supplies as required. If item is not included in the supplies group projects, (35c) strength to lift up to 50 lbs. catalog, forward request to the administrator who has procurement responsibilities. Have responsibility for Hamilton janitorial supplies. 10% Perform other duties as assigned by administrator. Knowledge of (13b); Ability to (30d) deal with problems involving few variables in familiar context, (31b) read & record figures accurately, (32f), (32i), (33b). PLAINTIFF'S **EXHIBITS** 26 FEB '01 List Position Numbers and Class Titles of positions directly supervised. REPRESENTATIVE

# Butler County Department of Human Services

		SEAT COMPANY COMPANY		BODES-211
SUBJECT Annu	ب ا د و اه	Men	6-11-90	· 通知本法公共() · 四、电话()
Dianno	London	- B.		The state of the s
el am new	estino a su		enda Bung	
el am negu Employee p	Verles mars :	ung to de	ocuss	
	-govinince le	aluation.		
Informal &	meeting was	held on 6	-8-90 with	,
Linda Duff	and Lynn	Mitchell.		

To: Dianne Logodon Justicet: Rebuttal letter to Employee performance evaluation Beceived: Tuesday, June 5th, 1990 at 3:45 p.m. el fal that my evaluation is an unjusted evaluation, and a means of retaliation against you for not coming footh to speak against Dianne Cameron, when Linda Duff acked you to. For these months, Linda Duff and I had became very close. I had told her - They deepert feeling about making the mailnoom the best it could be . My past evaluation of 11/22/88 and 5/16/89 (which Linda Duff concur with Jack Dudash comment)
proves that my decires were real and my dreams were coming true, el had reorganized the printing room function into a more efficient and productive work area. My selfbecause my drive was coming from my heart of soul. Mow my heart is pieced and my self esteem has dropped the of the reason is because when I complaint to the administrator about Linda Ouff, the administrator let Linda Duy tuen the complaints back around on me. Linda Duff issid that I was rude to her when I made a suggestion on the requisition forms. Linda Duff witherses wasn't elen aware of the incident. But when I complainted to you about Linda Duff and il had witnesses, nothing

(	
\.	was done about the incident. you, Mrs.
	Logsdon told me that disciplinary was
	a mistake since proming Supervisor of
<del></del>	a mistake since piconing Supervisor of
	communication unit.)
	I feel that Linda Duff is very cruel and a
	Vindictive person. The only time she's nice,
	is when she wants something from you.
	the my case, was spiring against Delaners.
	I am doing my job to the best of my
~~~~ ·	ability with the pressure, she has
	a lots of stress. I have been in your
	a lots of stress. I have been in your
	office on a numbers of occasions. Linda
	Duff has told me that the telephones were
	bugged, and that you all have talked
	bugged, and that you all have falked
	on the switch board for years. So, if you
	discussed D. Cameson, how do you
	think it jeet, you feel about ne?
#	5 Demonotrates willingness to accept responsibility.
	(A) I haven 4 refused to do anothing that was
<del></del>	asked of sne. If I would refuse or argue with
	Linda Duff, I would have received a verbal
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	warning of a weller warning more than
	(b) Kinda Duff said I argue with her on
	our_occasions_when_910.one_was
(	around. @ make up a form @ close file
	1 Intake copies "up front" D switchboard & Shedder
a a a a a sanara.	Copie count, PLAINTIFF'SEXHIBITS

pg. 3

· when asked to make
1. Making up a new form. When asked to make
The state of the s
new form up before, because the casearder
The limit alling made ago according
The man to the things to the to the
The Telephone Tumoro with
2 (1 mg 1,00) - 1/4 FRUMAU 1/60 - 3,170 1, LUNGO 2-7/
1 (1 1 (1 ) A DON MO WIFFELD TO THE
- m told them) they was freely
Lillian IM will little (1911 / 1911) (1911 / 1911)
reach for into Key Man 1.10 W 1.10 miles
my that ANY - Willer TD 100000 011
$I = I \cup $
7 / Land King IM LAPIT (1)(VIL. ACCULATION
I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I
MAIN I PIT C PEUCH LEVING WITH THE
The ware only no To Tolly The W W WW. T
somall volume, I did intake copies from 1.15-0.25 Am.
may Walters assist me the first day. The second
day, Monday, Nov. 6 4 1989, I was doing a large
MADE IN THE COLUMN TO THE THE PARTY OF THE P
only ask Linda, if I could have some help,
an at to mailletin Little repetition
your job, do it! # then go to close for the
nemainder of the day. I asked Linda about
rumainder of the day. I asked Linda about  rum yob in mailroom, Linda said that if  was arguing about close file.  3-26
was arguing about close file.
3-28

pg. 4.

5. Shredder - when we first received shredder, Linda Ruf had Judy Coleman (summer help) shredding paper from 8:30 am to 12:00 oclock noon. Ot 1:00 I was in the mailroom eating -lunch, when Linda came into mailroom and tact shredding paper. White particles was flying everywhere, it was getting into my food. I told Linda that the white stuff was everywhere, even in my food. Linda continue to went into breaknoom for the remainder of my lunch period. Linda Knew I est lunch in mailroom everyday at 1:00, she was also aware of the white particles floating in the air fudy Colemans how was covered with. white film. She looked like an old gray-haved lady. That right fudy washed her have, and still had white particles in her have. The next day, I told Linds about Judy hair, because. Linda told me that I will be doing the shredding. Linda told me, whether I like it or not, I was going to do the shredding, On 11-15-89, cl talked to Koy Kadle about the incident. I asked him could BCDHS order some plastic. caps to protect my have. I also talked to him about close file, and that it was falling befund in my work. Roy asked me did el refuse to work in close file on the shredder. Il told him I did not I tried to talk to Linda first, because I thought a women would under stand more about the situation. 3:30 p.m Linda

Suitable and I've
Switchboard - Linda Duff, at one time had
me nelewing Carol Lilibridge 3 time per day;
The thing of the same
my own break of I'm back on switch board
The water that the water
Will some New West Con Stand
Capies Count, when Linda approached me
Copies Count, when hinda approached me
the copier kinda wanted me to calculate
which copies used the to calculate
Personal telephone call it do used the
telephone on lunch hours and break time.
- I may received a sersonal case but I
may received a seesonal call, but I make the call short & bieif. I have
The flat want to call (MS) divino it
The same and Charles Alpert to continue the same of
fim feffery has knowledge of this. Because  I feel that the phones may be bugged, I'm  not going to abuse the telephone system.  On two occasion, Linda Duff may have  abuse the telephone system.
el feet that the phones may be bugged, I'm
On two many to abuse the telephone system.
- abuse the tolestore water
from 12:13 - 12:39 et tried to to
and the line of him
- Called Franke Leither to see if something
was wrong with the phone system. She  told me that kinda Duff was on the  phone it was a present and
- told me that kinda Duff was on the
phone, it was a personal call.  PLAINTIFF EXHIBITS

pg. 6.

On 10-31-89 Of 2:35 pm, Linda made a personal\_call on set. 4185. She was \_\_\_\_ on the sphere until 2:59 talking about was less came in 3 different time as fay was wanting to see kinds on a matter. If the telephone are kugged, evidentes will only - shows that I am telling the truth! - Making copies for intake. Linda Duff states that it takes me approximately 1/2 hours or more to copy verifications for intake, while others who do the job in my absence can complete the work in appear. Thous or less. The times varies ....day to day on whats need to be copy. I have no control over the amount of verifications that the client being in also Franke & Dailend use the copier for month repeating + other veryication. Linda Duff told copies, their copies take priorities over mines. Frankie has been copying the verification in my absence, she told me that she usually get done between 9-10 oclock. I also tried to use the entake copies + I still have to wait. # 13 Quantity of work. Because there was large amount of paper being worked, due to forms changing frequently, I told Linda \_\_\_\_\_\_ that I would only print forms as I \_\_\_\_\_\_ neceived orders, unless I know the form well day the same. also with other duties, it is difficult to punt, if I'm clains something else PLAINTIFF'S

an operator. The machine must be clean, + loaded. I do more than print forms. Since I have been in the mailroom, I have made some improvement in my area I have had departments nave about how fast they have necessed these forms, and that in the good, they were lucky to even get their forms. I feel that I deserve a better nating, because I worked for it; I deserved it! I put in my eight housin everyday. you better believe that Linda and Randy have been watching my every move and that they would have been wrote up. The abuse that I have taken from Lenda Vuff is not fair. It seem like the good people who's willing to work, gets walked on, and the lazy people get away with everything. offer me another position under M. Buln, if you didn't feel it could do the fol fol why wown't the job posted t why did you want see to keep it a secret. Why asked me to start over with Linda uff, if I am the only one starting over?

JG, 9.

Otherwise, I don't have anything to ... say to Linda and she doesn't like

A haven 4 had anyother problem, with anyother supervisor but Linda Duff.
The past evaluations speak for themselves.

Sincuely

Brenda Bing

-- PLAINTIFF'S EXHIBITS

3-34